Peer Review 1 for Amanda Luby
A Log-Linear Model Approach for Eyewitness Identification Data

Reviewer: Josue Orellana

1) General comments

This type of journal format is very easy to navigate. But that doesn't mean that it is simple to write. You have done a good job in putting everything in the appropriate subsections. The introduction flows very well. And the Data section is very clear. Section 3 is more challenging to communicate, but it is very good.
I have one small suggestion for section 3. I would find it helpful if you included a brief outline of the statistical issues from 3.1,3.2, and 3.3 in the paragraph right above 3.1. Just so that the reader gets to know more about the subsequent sections at that point.

2) Specific comments

Section 1. Page 3, 2nd paragraph.
"There have been many different procedures…." The previous sentence also started with there have been. Also "including" is after the "," which makes it sound as part of a single list element.

Section 1. Page 3, 3rd paragraph.
"In the context of a binary classification …. , it is a useful tool". The topic, middle and stress positions seem correct. However, I feel that it is a very long middle section and I tend to get lost in it. You might want to consider breaking this into two sentences: "In the context of a binary classification ... it is a useful tool". "Because …."

Section 1. Page 3, 3rd paragraph.
"These differences have led to a divide ... , and it is extremely important..." There are two main ideas in this sentence. Do you want to break them up instead of connecting them with an "and".

Section 1. Page 4, 3rd paragraph
"Not only does a log linear…." You might want to consider highlighting the two characteristics of your proposed model as advantages.

Section 2. Page 4, 2nd paragraph
"This data". Data should be plural.
"The participant was then given a target..." consistency of plural and singular to describe the participants.
"After [the?] participants made a selection". Also: here you might want to use "finally" instead of after, because you already started a previous sentence in this paragraph with "after".

Section 2. Page 4, 3rd paragraph

"To avoid the issue…, we have restricted". If the topic is "we have restricted..." and the stress is "to avoid the issue", then maybe the order of this sentence should be reversed.

Section 3. Page 5, 1st paragraph
(ROC) typically we only present abbreviations the first time the word is used.

Section 3. Page 5, 2nd paragraph
"When used to analyze…." This section needs clarification. It contains many ideas and it's difficult to identify the topic and stress positions. How about if you start with stating the problem at the beginning: "There is a skewed perception of eyewitness… "